The Burger Court Opinion Writing Database

Aspen Skiing Co. v. Aspen Highlands Skiing Corp.

472 U.S. 585 (1985)

Paul J. Wahlbeck, George Washington University James F. Spriggs, II, Washington University in St. Louis Forrest Maltzman, George Washington University











Supreme Court of the Anited States Washington, P. C. 20543

CHAMBERS OF THE CHIEF JUSTICE

June 11, 1985

Re: No. 84-510 - Aspen Skiing v. Aspen Highlands

Dear John,

I join.

Regards,

Justice Stevens
Copies to the Conference



CHAMBERS OF JUSTICE WH. J. BRENNAN, JR.

Supreme Court of the Anited States Washington, P. C. 20543

June 3, 1985

18. 18 34 83. 78.

No. 84-510

Aspen Skiing Company v. Aspen Highlands Skiing Corporation

Dear John,

I agree.

Sincerely,

12 nd

Justice Stevens

Copies to the Conference

Supreme Court of the United States Mashington, P. C. 20543

CHAMBERS OF JUSTICE BYRON R. WHITE

June 4, 1985

84-510 - Aspen Skiing Company v. Aspen Highlands Skiing Corporation

Dear John,

I have had from the outset some doubt about participating in the decision in this case; and after reading your draft and looking at the record, I would feel better if you would show me as not participating in the decision in this case.

Sincerely,

Justice Stevens

Copies to the Conference

Supreme Court of the United States Washington. P. C. 20543

CHAMBERS OF
JUSTICE THURGOOD MARSHALL

June 5, 1985

Re: No. 84-510-Aspen Skiing Co. v. Aspen Highlands Skiing Corp.

Dear John:

While I would prefer not to give the free advertisement you give to Aspen in the second paragraph of your opinion - I join.

Sincerely,

Im.

T.M.

Justice Stevens

cc: The Conference

Supreme Court of the United States Washington, P. C. 20543

CHAMBERS OF
JUSTICE HARRY A. BLACKMUN

June 7, 1985

Re: No. 84-510, Aspen Skiing v. Aspen Highlands

Dear John:

Please join me.

Sincerely,

Justice Stevens

cc: The Conference

SE: 68 L-112 - 58.

Supreme Court of the United States Washington, B. C. 20543

CHAMBERS OF JUSTICE LEWIS F. POWELL, JR.

June 5, 1985

84-510 Aspen Skiing v. Aspen Highlands

Dear John:

Please join me.

Sincerely,

Lewis

Justice Stevens

lfp/ss

cc: The Conference



Supreme Court of the United States Washington, B. C. 20543

CHAMBERS OF
JUSTICE WILLIAM H. REHNQUIST

June 4, 1985

Re: 84-510 - Aspen Skiing Company v. Aspen Highlands Skiing Corporation

57 M 34 m m

Dear John:

Please join me.

Sincerely,

www

Justice Stevens

cc: The Conference

While I will prefer not be give the Justice Brennan Justice White Justice Marshall Justice Bland Present Paragraph of Marshall Justice Bland Present P

From: Justice Stevens

3 1985 JUN

1st DRAFT

SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES

No. 84-510

ASPEN SKIING COMPANY, PETITIONER v. ASPEN HIGHLANDS SKIING CORPORATION

ON WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE TENTH CIRCUIT

[June ——, 1985]

JUSTICE STEVENS delivered the opinion for the Court.

In a private treble damages action, the jury found that petitioner Aspen Skiing Company (Ski Co.) had monopolized the market for downhill skiing services in Aspen, Colorado. The question presented is whether that finding is erroneous as a matter of law because it rests on an assumption that a firm with monopoly power has a duty to cooperate with its smaller rivals in a marketing arrangement in order to avoid violating §2 of the Sherman Act.1

Aspen is a destination ski resort with a reputation for "super powder," "a wide range of runs," and an "active night life," including "some of the best restaurants in North America." Tr. 765-767. Between 1945 and 1960, private investors independently developed three major facilities for downhill skiing: Aspen Mountain (Ajax),2 Aspen Highlands

¹The statute provides, in relevant part:

[&]quot;Every person who shall monopolize, or attempt to monopolize, or combine or conspire with any other person or persons, to monopolize any part of the trade or commerce among the several States, or with foreign nations, shall be deemed guilty of a felony" 15 U. S. C. § 2.

²Ski Co. developed Ajax in 1946. The runs are quite steep and primarily designed for expert or advanced intermediate skiers. The base area of Ajax is located within the village of Aspen.

STYLISTIC CHANGES THROUGHOUT.
SEE PAGES: 2, 2, 25

To: The Chief Justice
Justice Brennan
Justice White
Justice Marshall
Justice Blackmun
Justice Powell
Justice Rehnquist
Justice O'Connor

From: Justice Stevens

Circulated:

JUN

Recirculated:

.

2nd DRAFT

SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES

No. 84-510

ASPEN SKIING COMPANY, PETITIONER v. ASPEN HIGHLANDS SKIING CORPORATION

ON WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE TENTH CIRCUIT

[June ——, 1985]

JUSTICE STEVENS delivered the opinion for the Court.

In a private treble damages action, the jury found that petitioner Aspen Skiing Company (Ski Co.) had monopolized the market for downhill skiing services in Aspen, Colorado. The question presented is whether that finding is erroneous as a matter of law because it rests on an assumption that a firm with monopoly power has a duty to cooperate with its smaller rivals in a marketing arrangement in order to avoid violating §2 of the Sherman Act.

I

Aspen is a destination ski resort with a reputation for "super powder," "a wide range of runs," and an "active night life," including "some of the best restaurants in North America." Tr. 765–767. Between 1945 and 1960, private investors independently developed three major facilities for downhill skiing: Aspen Mountain (Ajax),² Aspen Highlands

¹The statute provides, in relevant part:

[&]quot;Every person who shall monopolize, or attempt to monopolize, or combine or conspire with any other person or persons, to monopolize any part of the trade or commerce among the several States, or with foreign nations, shall be deemed guilty of a felony" 15 U. S. C. § 2.

²Ski Co. developed Ajax in 1946. The runs are quite steep and primarily designed for expert or advanced intermediate skiers. The base area of Ajax is located within the village of Aspen.

STYLISTIC CHANGES THROUGHOUT.
SEE PAGES: 12,18

To: The Chief Justice
Justice Brennan
Justice White
Justice Marshall
Justice Blackmun
Justice Powell
Justice Rehnquist
Justice O'Connor

From: Justice Stevens

Circulated:

Recirculated: JUN 10 1605

3rd DRAFT

SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES

No. 84-510

ASPEN SKIING COMPANY, PETITIONER v. ASPEN HIGHLANDS SKIING CORPORATION

ON WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE TENTH CIRCUIT

[June ----, 1985]

JUSTICE STEVENS delivered the opinion for the Court.

In a private treble damages action, the jury found that petitioner Aspen Skiing Company (Ski Co.) had monopolized the market for downhill skiing services in Aspen, Colorado. The question presented is whether that finding is erroneous as a matter of law because it rests on an assumption that a firm with monopoly power has a duty to cooperate with its smaller rivals in a marketing arrangement in order to avoid violating §2 of the Sherman Act.

Ι

Aspen is a destination ski resort with a reputation for "super powder," "a wide range of runs," and an "active night life," including "some of the best restaurants in North America." Tr. 765-767. Between 1945 and 1960, private investors independently developed three major facilities for downhill skiing: Aspen Mountain (Ajax),² Aspen Highlands

¹The statute provides, in relevant part:

[&]quot;Every person who shall monopolize, or attempt to monopolize, or combine or conspire with any other person or persons, to monopolize any part of the trade or commerce among the several States, or with foreign nations, shall be deemed guilty of a felony" 15 U. S. C. § 2.

²Ski Co. developed Ajax in 1946. The runs are quite steep and primarily designed for expert or advanced intermediate skiers. The base area of Ajax is located within the village of Aspen.

SERS OF

Supreme'Court of the United States Washington, D. C. 20543

CHAMBERS OF JUSTICE SANDRA DAY O'CONNOR

June 10, 1985

No. 84-510 Aspen Skiing Company v. Aspen Highlands Skiing Corp.

Dear John,

Please join me.

Sincerely,

Sandra

Justice Stevens

'85 JM 10 PA :01

Copies to the Conference